# Table of Contents

Foreword
EStAL and the Sword in the Stone ............................................. V

Chapter 1 · BP Chemicals
BP Chemicals: Lessons to Be Recalled in the Context of Applying the MEIP to Consecutive State Measures in the Financial Sector . . . 2
Małgorzata Agnieszka Cyndecka

Chapter 2 · PreussenElektra
PreussenElektra – Dead or Alive? ............................................. 16
Kai Struckmann

Chapter 3 · Sardegna
Every Family Is the Same, Every Family Is Different: State Aid and Free Movement ......................................................... 34
Andrea Biondi

Chapter 4 · Stardust Marine
Notion d’aide d’Etat Remarques sur l’arrêt Stardust Marine du 16 mai 2002 ................................................................. 46
Alain Alexis
The Stardust Marine Case (C-482/99) .................................... 56
Juan Jorge Piernas López

Chapter 5 · SMI
The SMI-Judgment – a New Course for Recovery of Illegal State Aid? ................................................................. 70
Andreas Knaul
The Principles for Recovery: SMI or the Importance of a Meticulous Assessment of State Interventions by the Granting Authorities and the Commission ............................................ 77
Maria J. Segura, Marianne Clayton and Egill Olafsson
## Contents

**Chapter 6 · Altmark**  
Bidding Procedures in EC State Aid Surveillance over Public Services after Altmark Trans ................................ 90  
*Ulrich Schnelle*  
*Altmark: The Mount Everest of State Aid* ................................ 96  
*Phedon Nicolaides and Guido Paolini*

**Chapter 7 · Chronopost**  
Chronopost II: The Application of the Market Economy Investor Principle in Reserved Sectors ................................................. 114  
*Isabela Atanasiu*  
*Chronopost I – Re-Annotated* .................................................. 120  
*Andreas Bartosch*

**Chapter 8 · Pearle**  
“Pearle: so much Unsaid!” .......................................................... 128  
*Edoardo Gambaro, Alessandro Nucara, Luca Prete*  
*Pearle Revisited – Or Does Our State Aided Vision Really Improve with Hindsight?* .......................................................... 152  
*Leigh Hancher*

**Chapter 9 · BUPA**  
BUPA v. Commission ................................................................. 160  
*Andrea Biondi*  
*Case T-289/03 BUPA: The Illusion of Flexibility That Strengthened Altmark* ................................................................. 170  
*Alfonso Lamadrid de Pablo*

**Chapter 10 · Forum 187**  
Case Report Joined Cases C-182/03 (Belgium) and C-217/03 (Forum 187) v. Commission ................................................................. 180  
*Jayant Mehta*  
*Belgium and Forum 187 v. Commission Revisited: A Sound and Correct Legal Source for an At Arm’s Length Principle?* ............ 197  
*Tony Joris and Wout De Cock*
Chapter 11 · Azores
Review of the Judgment in Case C-88/03,
Portugal v. Commission (Azores Tax Regime) ................... 214
Carsten Zatschler
Tales from an Outermost Region: How Does the Azores
Judgment Look from a Distance? ............................... 223
Fiona Wishlade

Chapter 12 · Ryanair Charleroi
CFI judgment in the Charleroi case T-196/04 .................. 234
Dennis Oswell, George Metaxas and Esfandiar Vahida
Nicole Robins and Hannes Geldof

Chapter 13 · Laboratoires Boiron
Review of Judgment Laboratoires Boiron, Case C-526/04. .... 264
Holger Wissel and Dominik Becker
Laboratoires Boiron SA v ACOSS: A Retrospective .......... 272
Isabel Taylor

Chapter 14 · Athinaiki I & II
Athinaiki Techniki II .............................................. 282
Sébastien Thomas
The Status of Complainants in State Aid Cases:
A Look Back into the Athinkaiki Techniki Saga ................. 300
Fernando Pastor-Merchante

Chapter 15 · CELF I & II
The CELF-Judgment: A Precarious Conception
of the Standstill Obligation ....................................... 314
Thomas Jaeger
Judgment of the Court of the European Union in case C-1/09,
CELF v SIDE ..................................................... 334
Adrien Giraud
The Powers and Obligations of National Courts with Regard to
Unlawful State Aid: Lessons Learned from CELF I and CELF II ... 342
Jacques Derenne
Chapter 16 · British Aggregates
Selectivity and Taxation – Reflections in the Light of Case
C-487/06 P, British Aggregates Association .......................... 358
Michael Honoré
The British Aggregates Saga – Looking Back at an Earlier Stage
of the Selectivity Discussion ........................................... 377
Clemens Ziegler

Chapter 17 · Paint Graphos
The Preliminary Ruling of the Court of Justice on Preferential
Taxation of Cooperatives and State Aid Rules .................... 386
Flavia Tomat
Finding Selectivity or the Art of Comparison .......................... 410
José Luis Buendía Sierra

Chapter 18 · Dutch NOx
NOx Emission Trading Rights: A Government Gift or
Value Created by Undertakings? ........................................... 424
Piet Jan Slot
The NOx Case – Still Trying to Fit in a System .......................... 438
Philipp Werner

Chapter 19 · DHL Leipzig Halle
State Aid and Public Funding for Infrastructure .................... 454
Erika Szyszczak

Chapter 20 · Smurfit Kappa
Commission Guidelines and their Limits T-304/08
Smurfit Kappa ............................................................... 466
Vincent Verouden

Chapter 21 · Gibraltar
Gibraltar: Beyond the Pillars of Hercules of Selectivity............. 480
Pierpaolo Rossi-Maccanico
Gibraltar: A Landmark Judgment Which Was Not
Meant to Be ................................................................. 489
Pierpaolo Rossi-Maccanico
Chapter 22 · EDF
Tax Measures and the Private Investor Test: The Court of Justice
Endorses a Level Playing Field
Niels Baeten and Liliane Gam
European Commission v Electricité de France – a Distant Mirror
Bernhard von Wendland and Hanna Standtke

Chapter 23 · France Télécom
The Bouygues Case: A Never Ending Story
María Muñoz de Juan
Can Mere Declarations by a State Be Considered as an Advantage
Drawn from State Resources: An Economic Perspective
Alejandro Requejo Tovar

Chapter 24 · TV2 Danmark
The Origin of State Resources: Awaiting the Court’s Ruling in
Case C-656/15P European Commission v TV2/Danmark A/S
Mihalis Kekelekis

Chapter 25 · Ryanair v Commission
Appeal against Alitalia State Aid Decisions by Ryanair Dismissed
John Milligan and Luke Sales
Case C-287/12 P, Ryanair v. Commission: a Tale of Lost Opportunity
Elisabetta Righini

Chapter 26 · Deutsche Lufthansa
Binding Effect of Opening Decisions – Lufthansa AG v FFH
Lucyne Ghazarian
The Obligations of National Courts after an Opening Decision
Lucyne Ghazarian and Christian Koenig

Chapter 27 · Ciudad de la Luz
Public Investment in a Cinema Studio and State Aid Rules:
The Last Showing
Marianne Clayton, Maria J. Segura, Egill D. Ólafsson
Ciudad de la Luz Judgment – An In-Depth Review of the Market
Economy Investor Principle
Adina Claici
Chapter 28 · ING
   Testing the Soundness of the Commission’s Practice
   on State aid to the Financial Sector ........................... 652
   Jose Manuel Panero Rivas
   The ING Case ........................................... 666
   Piet Jan Slot

Chapter 29 · Eventech
   Eventech, the Selectivity of a Bus Lines Policy ............... 680
   Laura Parret and Greetje van Heezik

Chapter 30 · Mediaset
   It may be zero! CJEU highlights national courts’ authority
   to review and determine amounts of aid to be recovered .... 694
   Nina Niejahr
   Mediaset III: The Recovery Revolution Deactivated ........ 703
   Massimo Merola

Chapter 31 · Klausner Holz
   State Aid as a Defence for Public Authorities? ............... 718
   Grith Skovgaard Ølykke
   Annotation on the Judgment C-505/14
   Klausner Holz Niedersachsen v Land Nordrhein-Westfalen .... 727
   Péter Staviczky

Chapter 32 · World Duty Free Group
   Bury Them Deep: The Court of Justice Annuls the Autogrill
   and Banco Santander Judgments of the General Court ....... 740
   Adrien Giraud and Sylvain Petit
   Joined Cases C-20/15 P and C-21/15 P,
   European Commission v World Duty Free Group SA, Banco
   Santander SA and Santusa Holding SL ........................ 750
   Conor Quigley QC