# Table of Contents

Foreword  
EStAL and the Sword in the Stone ........................................... V

Chapter 1 · BP Chemicals  
*BP Chemicals: Lessons to Be Recalled in the Context of Applying the MEIP to Consecutive State Measures in the Financial Sector* ........................................... 2  
*Małgorzata Agnieszka Cyndecka*

Chapter 2 · PreussenElektra  
*PreussenElektra – Dead or Alive?* ........................................... 16  
*Kai Struckmann*

Chapter 3 · Sardegna  
*Every Family Is the Same, Every Family Is Different: State Aid and Free Movement* ........................................... 34  
*Andrea Biondi*

Chapter 4 · Stardust Marine  
*Notion d’aide d’Etat Remarques sur l’arrêt Stardust Marine du 16 mai 2002* ........................................... 46  
*Alain Alexis*  
*The Stardust Marine Case (C-482/99)* ........................................... 56  
*Juan Jorge Piernas López*

Chapter 5 · SMI  
*The SMI-Judgment – a New Course for Recovery of Illegal State Aid?* ........................................... 70  
*Andreas Knaul*  
*The Principles for Recovery: SMI or the Importance of a Meticulous Assessment of State Interventions by the Granting Authorities and the Commission* ........................................... 77  
*Maria J. Segura, Marianne Clayton and Egill Olafsson*
Chapter 6 · Altmark
   Bidding Procedures in EC State Aid Surveillance over Public Services after Altmark Trans ............................................ 90
     Ulrich Schnelle
   Altmark: The Mount Everest of State Aid ........................................... 96
     Phedon Nicolaides and Guido Paolini

Chapter 7 · Chronopost
   Chronopost II: The Application of the Market Economy Investor Principle in Reserved Sectors ............................................ 114
     Isabela Atanasiu
   Chronopost I – Re-Annotated ........................................... 120
     Andreas Bartosch

Chapter 8 · Pearle
   “Pearle: so much Unsaid!” ........................................... 128
     Edoardo Gambaro, Alessandro Nucara, Luca Prete
   Pearle Revisited – Or Does Our State Aided Vision Really Improve with Hindsight? ........................................... 152
     Leigh Hancher

Chapter 9 · BUPA
   BUPA v. Commission ........................................... 160
     Andrea Biondi
   Case T-289/03 BUPA: The Illusion of Flexibility That Strengthened Altmark ........................................... 170
     Alfonso Lamadrid de Pablo

Chapter 10 · Forum 187
   Case Report Joined Cases C-182/03 (Belgium) and C-217/03 (Forum 187) v. Commission ........................................... 180
     Jayant Mehta
   Belgium and Forum 187 v. Commission Revisited: A Sound and Correct Legal Source for an At Arm’s Length Principle? ........................................... 197
     Tony Joris and Wout De Cock
Chapter 11 · Azores
Carsten Zatschler
*Tales from an Outermost Region: How Does the Azores Judgment Look from a Distance?* ............................. 223
Fiona Wishlade

Chapter 12 · Ryanair Charleroi
CFI judgment in the Charleroi case T-196/04 ............................. 234
Dennis Oswell, George Metaxas and Esfandiar Vahida
Nicole Robins and Hannes Geldof

Chapter 13 · Laboratoires Boiron
Review of Judgment Laboratoires Boiron, Case C-526/04 ............................. 264
Holger Wissel and Dominik Becker
*Laboratoires Boiron SA v ACOSS: A Retrospective* ............................. 272
Isabel Taylor

Chapter 14 · Athinaiki I & II
Athinaiki Techniki II ............................. 282
Sébastien Thomas
*The Status of Complainants in State Aid Cases: A Look Back into the Athinaiki Techniki Saga* ............................. 300
Fernando Pastor-Merchante

Chapter 15 · CELF I & II
The CELF-Judgment: A Precarious Conception of the Standstill Obligation ............................. 314
Thomas Jaeger
Judgment of the Court of the European Union in case C-1/09, *CELF v SIDE* ............................. 334
Adrien Giraud
*The Powers and Obligations of National Courts with Regard to Unlawful State Aid: Lessons Learned from CELF I and CELF II* ............................. 342
Jacques Derenne
Chapter 16 · British Aggregates
Selectivity and Taxation – Reflections in the Light of Case
C-487/06 P, British Aggregates Association ........................... 358
Michael Honoré
The British Aggregates Saga – Looking Back at an Earlier Stage
of the Selectivity Discussion ............................................. 377
Clemens Ziegler

Chapter 17 · Paint Graphos
The Preliminary Ruling of the Court of Justice on Preferential
Taxation of Cooperatives and State Aid Rules ......................... 386
Flavia Tomat
Finding Selectivity or the Art of Comparison ............................ 410
José Luis Buendía Sierra

Chapter 18 · Dutch NOx
NOx Emission Trading Rights: A Government Gift or
Value Created by Undertakings? ......................................... 424
Piet Jan Slot
The NOx Case – Still Trying to Fit in a System .......................... 438
Philipp Werner

Chapter 19 · DHL Leipzig Halle
State Aid and Public Funding for Infrastructure ......................... 454
Erika Szyszczak

Chapter 20 · Smurfit Kappa
Commission Guidelines and their Limits T-304/08
Smurfit Kappa ................................................................. 466
Vincent Verouden

Chapter 21 · Gibraltar
Gibraltar: Beyond the Pillars of Hercules of Selectivity ............. 480
Pierpaolo Rossi-Maccanico
Gibraltar: A Landmark Judgment Which Was Not
Meant to Be .................................................................. 489
Pierpaolo Rossi-Maccanico
Chapter 22 · EDF
Tax Measures and the Private Investor Test: The Court of Justice
Endorses a Level Playing Field ........................................ 508
Niels Baeten and Liliane Gam

European Commission v Electricité de France – a Distant Mirror . . 517
Bernhard von Wendland and Hanna Standtke

Chapter 23 · France Télécom
The Bouygues Case: A Never Ending Story .......................... 532
María Muñoz de Juan
Can Mere Declarations by a State Be Considered as an Advantage
Drawn from State Resources: An Economic Perspective ............ 552
Alejandro Requejo Tovar

Chapter 24 · TV2 Danmark
The Origin of State Resources: Awaiting the Court’s Ruling in
Case C-656/15P European Commission v TV2/Danmark A/S ...... 560
Mihalis Kekelekis

Chapter 25 · Ryanair v Commission
Appeal against Alitalia State Aid Decisions by Ryanair Dismissed .. 570
John Milligan and Luke Sales
Case C-287/12 P, Ryanair v. Commission:
a Tale of Lost Opportunity ................................................ 584
Elisabetta Righini

Chapter 26 · Deutsche Lufthansa
Binding Effect of Opening Decisions – Lufthansa AG v FFH ...... 604
Lucyne Ghazarian
The Obligations of National Courts after an Opening Decision .... 616
Lucyne Ghazarian and Christian Koenig

Chapter 27 · Ciudad de la Luz
Public Investment in a Cinema Studio and State Aid Rules:
The Last Showing ......................................................... 624
Marianne Clayton, Maria J. Segura, Egill D. Ólafsson
Ciudad de la Luz Judgment – An In-Depth Review of the Market
Economy Investor Principle ............................................. 641
Adina Claici
Chapter 28 · ING
Testing the Soundness of the Commission’s Practice on State aid to the Financial Sector .................................................. 652
Jose Manuel Panero Rivas
The ING Case ................................................................. 666
Piet Jan Slot

Chapter 29 · Eventech
Eventech, the Selectivity of a Bus Lines Policy ............................. 680
Laura Parret and Greetje van Heezik

Chapter 30 · Mediaset
It may be zero! CJEU highlights national courts’ authority to review and determine amounts of aid to be recovered .......... 694
Nina Niejahr
Mediaset III: The Recovery Revolution Deactivated .................... 703
Massimo Merola

Chapter 31 · Klausner Holz
State Aid as a Defence for Public Authorities? .......................... 718
Grith Skovgaard Ølykke
Annotation on the Judgment C-505/14 Klausner Holz Niedersachsen v Land Nordrhein-Westfalen ............... 727
Péter Staviczky

Chapter 32 · World Duty Free Group
Bury Them Deep: The Court of Justice Annuls the Autogrill and Banco Santander Judgments of the General Court ............. 740
Adrien Giraud and Sylvain Petit
Joined Cases C-20/15 P and C-21/15 P, European Commission v World Duty Free Group SA, Banco Santander SA and Santusa Holding SL ............................................. 750
Conor Quigley QC