

Table of Contents

Foreword	
EStAL and the Sword in the Stone	V
Chapter 1 · BP Chemicals	
<i>BP Chemicals: Lessons to Be Recalled in the Context of Applying the MEIP to Consecutive State Measures in the Financial Sector . . .</i>	2
<i>Małgorzata Agnieszka Cyndecka</i>	
Chapter 2 · PreussenElektra	
<i>PreussenElektra – Dead or Alive?</i>	16
<i>Kai Struckmann</i>	
Chapter 3 · Sardegna	
Every Family Is the Same, Every Family Is Different: State Aid and Free Movement	34
<i>Andrea Biondi</i>	
Chapter 4 · Stardust Marine	
Notion d’aide d’Etat Remarques sur l’arrêt <i>Stardust Marine</i> du 16 mai 2002	46
<i>Alain Alexis</i>	
The <i>Stardust Marine</i> Case (C-482/99)	56
<i>Juan Jorge Piernas López</i>	
Chapter 5 · SMI	
The SMI-Judgment – a New Course for Recovery of Illegal State Aid?	70
<i>Andreas Knaul</i>	
The Principles for Recovery: SMI or the Importance of a Meticulous Assessment of State Interventions by the Granting Authorities and the Commission.	77
<i>Maria J. Segura, Marianne Clayton and Egill Olafsson</i>	

Chapter 6 · Altmark

Bidding Procedures in EC State Aid Surveillance over Public Services after Altmark Trans	90
<i>Ulrich Schnelle</i>	
Altmark: The Mount Everest of State Aid	96
<i>Phedon Nicolaides and Guido Paolini</i>	

Chapter 7 · Chronopost

Chronopost II: The Application of the Market Economy Investor Principle in Reserved Sectors	114
<i>Isabela Atanasiu</i>	
Chronopost I – Re-Annotated	120
<i>Andreas Bartosch</i>	

Chapter 8 · Pearle

“Pearle: so much Unsaid!”	128
<i>Edoardo Gambaro, Alessandro Nucara, Luca Prete</i>	
Pearle Revisited – Or Does Our State Aided Vision Really Improve with Hindsight?	152
<i>Leigh Hancher</i>	

Chapter 9 · BUPA

BUPA v. Commission	160
<i>Andrea Biondi</i>	
Case T-289/03 BUPA: The Illusion of Flexibility That Strengthened Altmark	170
<i>Alfonso Lamadrid de Pablo</i>	

Chapter 10 · Forum 187

Case Report Joined Cases C-182/03 (Belgium) and C-217/03 (Forum 187) v. Commission	180
<i>Jayant Mehta</i>	
Belgium and Forum 187 v. Commission Revisited: A Sound and Correct Legal Source for an At Arm’s Length Principle?	197
<i>Tony Joris and Wout De Cock</i>	

Chapter 11 · Azores	
Review of the Judgment in Case C-88/03, <i>Portugal v. Commission</i> (Azores Tax Regime)	214
<i>Carsten Zatschler</i>	
Tales from an Outermost Region: How Does the Azores Judgment Look from a Distance?	223
<i>Fiona Wisblade</i>	
 Chapter 12 · Ryanair Charleroi	
CFI judgment in the Charleroi case T-196/04	234
<i>Dennis Oswell, George Metaxas and Esfandiar Vahida</i>	
The Ryanair Charleroi Judgment: What Is Its Legacy?	246
<i>Nicole Robins and Hannes Geldof</i>	
 Chapter 13 · Laboratoires Boiron	
Review of Judgment Laboratoires Boiron, Case C-526/04.	264
<i>Holger Wissel and Dominik Becker</i>	
<i>Laboratoires Boiron SA v ACOSS</i>: A Retrospective	272
<i>Isabel Taylor</i>	
 Chapter 14 · Athinaiki I & II	
Athinaiki Techniki II	282
<i>Sébastien Thomas</i>	
The Status of Complainants in State Aid Cases: A Look Back into the <i>Athinkaiki Techniki</i> Saga	300
<i>Fernando Pastor-Merchante</i>	
 Chapter 15 · CELF I & II	
The CELF-Judgment: A Precarious Conception of the Standstill Obligation	314
<i>Thomas Jaeger</i>	
Judgment of the Court of the European Union in case C-1/09, <i>CELF v SIDE</i>	334
<i>Adrien Giraud</i>	
The Powers and Obligations of National Courts with Regard to Unlawful State Aid: Lessons Learned from <i>CELF I</i> and <i>CELF II</i>.	342
<i>Jacques Derenne</i>	

Chapter 16 · British Aggregates

- Selectivity and Taxation – Reflections in the Light of Case C-487/06 P, British Aggregates Association** 358
Michael Honoré
- The *British Aggregates* Saga – Looking Back at an Earlier Stage of the Selectivity Discussion** 377
Clemens Ziegler

Chapter 17 · Paint Graphos

- The Preliminary Ruling of the Court of Justice on Preferential Taxation of Cooperatives and State Aid Rules** 386
Flavia Tomat
- Finding Selectivity or the Art of Comparison** 410
José Luis Buendía Sierra

Chapter 18 · Dutch NOx

- NOx Emission Trading Rights: A Government Gift or Value Created by Undertakings?** 424
Piet Jan Slot
- The *NOx Case* – Still Trying to Fit in a System** 438
Philipp Werner

Chapter 19 · DHL Leipzig Halle

- State Aid and Public Funding for Infrastructure** 454
Erika Szyszczak

Chapter 20 · Smurfit Kappa

- Commission Guidelines and their Limits T-304/08 *Smurfit Kappa*** 466
Vincent Verouden

Chapter 21 · Gibraltar

- Gibraltar*: Beyond the Pillars of Hercules of Selectivity** 480
Pierpaolo Rossi-Maccanico
- Gibraltar*: A Landmark Judgment Which Was Not Meant to Be** 489
Pierpaolo Rossi-Maccanico

Chapter 22 · EDF	
Tax Measures and the Private Investor Test: The Court of Justice	
Endorses a Level Playing Field	508
<i>Niels Baeten and Liliane Gam</i>	
<i>European Commission v Electricité de France</i> – a Distant Mirror . . .	517
<i>Bernhard von Wendland and Hanna Standtke</i>	
Chapter 23 · France Télécom	
The <i>Bouygues</i> Case: A Never Ending Story	532
<i>María Muñoz de Juan</i>	
Can Mere Declarations by a State Be Considered as an Advantage	
Drawn from State Resources: An Economic Perspective	552
<i>Alejandro Requejo Tovar</i>	
Chapter 24 · TV2 Danmark	
The Origin of State Resources: Awaiting the Court’s Ruling in	
Case C-656/15P <i>European Commission v TV2/Danmark A/S</i>	560
<i>Mihalis Kekelekis</i>	
Chapter 25 · Ryanair v Commission	
Appeal against Alitalia State Aid Decisions by Ryanair Dismissed . .	570
<i>John Milligan and Luke Sales</i>	
Case C-287/12 P, <i>Ryanair v. Commission</i>:	
a Tale of Lost Opportunity	584
<i>Elisabetta Righini</i>	
Chapter 26 · Deutsche Lufthansa	
Binding Effect of Opening Decisions – <i>Lufthansa AG v FFH</i>	604
<i>Lucyne Ghazarian</i>	
The Obligations of National Courts after an Opening Decision . . .	616
<i>Lucyne Ghazarian and Christian Koenig</i>	
Chapter 27 · Ciudad de la Luz	
Public Investment in a Cinema Studio and State Aid Rules:	
The Last Showing	624
<i>Marianne Clayton, Maria J. Segura, Egill D. Ólafsson</i>	
<i>Ciudad de la Luz</i> Judgment – An In-Depth Review of the Market	
Economy Investor Principle	641
<i>Adina Claiici</i>	

Chapter 28 · ING

- Testing the Soundness of the Commission’s Practice
on State aid to the Financial Sector** 652
Jose Manuel Panero Rivas
- The ING Case** 666
Piet Jan Slot

Chapter 29 · Eventech

- Eventech, the Selectivity of a Bus Lines Policy** 680
Laura Parret and Greetje van Heezik

Chapter 30 · Mediaset

- It may be zero! CJEU highlights national courts’ authority
to review and determine amounts of aid to be recovered** 694
Nina Niejahr
- Mediaset III: The Recovery Revolution Deactivated** 703
Massimo Merola

Chapter 31 · Klausner Holz

- State Aid as a Defence for Public Authorities?** 718
Grith Skovgaard Ølykke
- Annotation on the Judgment C-505/14
Klausner Holz Niedersachsen v Land Nordrhein-Westfalen** 727
Péter Staviczký

Chapter 32 · World Duty Free Group

- Bury Them Deep: The Court of Justice Annuls the *Autogrill*
and *Banco Santander* Judgments of the General Court** 740
Adrien Giraud and Sylvain Petit
- Joined Cases C-20/15 P and C-21/15 P,
European Commission v World Duty Free Group SA, Banco
Santander SA and Santusa Holding SL** 750
Conor Quigley QC