Phedon Nicolaides

State Aid Uncovered

Critical Analysis
of Developments in State Aid 2022
Acknowledgements

A book is always a collective project. The weekly articles and this volume would not have been possible without the support of Lexxion’s editorial team. I would like to thank in particular Julia Thiemann and August Andreae.
# Table of Contents

1. **Introduction** ........................................... 11

2. **State Resources** ........................................ 15
   2.2. Funding of Aid with Revenue from Levies Imposed on the Aid Beneficiaries (Milk quality tests) .......... 19
   2.3. Intra-State Transfers and the Discretion of Public Authorities ........................................ 22

3. **Advantage** ............................................. 26
   3.1. “Substantial” Competitive Effect .......................... 26
   3.2. Compensation and Advantage ............................... 31
   3.3. Compensation for Damage and De Minimis Aid ........... 38
   3.4. Injection of Capital in a Postal Operator .................. 44
   3.5. The Date on which State Aid is Deemed to be Granted Is not necessarily the Date on which the Actual Benefit Materialises ........................................ 51
   3.7. The State Behaving Like a Private Land Owner .......... 62
   3.8. Public Authorities Acting as Private Creditors .......... 67
   3.9. Advantage in Contracts to Provide Services .......... 75
   3.10. Private Creditor and the Ability of the Debtor to Repay .... 80
   3.11. Advantage from Non-compliance with State Aid Guidelines .. 91
   3.12. State Guarantees without State Aid ...................... 95
   3.13. State Guarantees for Undertakings in Difficulty .......... 101

4. **Selectivity** ............................................. 111
   4.1. A Non-Selective Financial Tax with a Narrow Scope .......................... 111
   4.2. Territoriality and the Tax Treatment of Intra-group Transactions .................. 119
4.3. Selectivity of Regional Schemes ..................................... 130
4.4. The “Arm’s Length Principle” and the Taxation
of Transactions between Related Companies .................. 136

5. Affectation of Trade ................................................. 145
5.1. No Effect on Trade ............................................. 145

6. Article 107(2)(a) .................................................. 150
6.1. An Innovative Scheme to Support Individual Borrowers .... 150

7. Article 107(2)(b) .................................................. 159
7.1. Compensation for Damage from a Natural Disaster ......... 159
7.2. Compensation for Damage from an Exceptional
Occurrence ...................................................... 164

8. Article 107(3)(b) .................................................. 176
8.1. Individual Aid to Counter the Effects of Serious Economic
Disturbance ...................................................... 176

9. Environmental and Energy Aid ..................................... 185
9.1. Public Funding of an Energy Infrastructure Project ......... 185
9.2. Natural Gas Storage ........................................... 190
9.3. The Link between State Aid and Environmental Provisions
of EU Law ...................................................... 197

10. Regional Aid ....................................................... 206
10.1. Duplication of Infrastructure Does not Promote Regional
Development .................................................... 206
10.2. Special Economic Zones ..................................... 211

11. Research Aid ....................................................... 218
11.1. Economic Activities of a Research Organisation .......... 218
11.2. Research Organisations, their Primary Objectives and
their Shareholders ............................................. 231
11.3. Support for Research & Innovation in the Context
of the Temporary Framework .................................. 239
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Risk Finance</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.1.</td>
<td>Tax Incentives to Corporate Investors</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Undertakings in Difficulty</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.1.</td>
<td>The Concept of “Undertaking in Difficulty” and Evidential Requirements</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Rescue Aid</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.1.</td>
<td>The Rights of Competitors of Rescued Undertakings</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.</td>
<td>The Difficulty of Separating the various Causes of Financial Difficulties</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Article 106(2)</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.1.</td>
<td>Altmark Compliant Measure</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.2.</td>
<td>A Rare Commission Decision on SGEI Interpreting Decision 2012/21</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.3.</td>
<td>Compensation for the Net Cost of Public Service Obligations</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4.</td>
<td>What Costs Must be Included in Compensation for Public Service Obligations?</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Article 93</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1.</td>
<td>State Aid for External Transport Costs</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2.</td>
<td>Compliance with Public Service Obligations Does Not Necessarily Entitle the Providers of Public Services to Compensation</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>State Aid Procedures</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.1.</td>
<td>The Commission Need not Always Open the Formal Investigation Procedure before Correcting a Faulty Decision</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2.</td>
<td>The Standard of Proof in State Aid Complaints and the “Informational Disadvantage” of Complainants</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.3.</td>
<td>Legal Standing of Competitors</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.</td>
<td>The Consequences of not Knowing when State Aid is State Aid</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.5.</td>
<td>State Aid and Anti-Competitive Practices</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
18. **Recovery of Incompatible State Aid** .......................... 344
   18.1. Consequences of Failure to Recover Incompatible Aid ........ 344
   18.2. Member States Must Recover of their Own Initiative Illegally Granted Aid. .................................................. 348
   18.3. Recovery of Incompatible Aid and the Application of General Provisions for the Avoidance of Double Taxation . . 351
   18.4. Temporary Crisis Framework ........................................ 359