

*Phedon Nicolaides*

# State Aid Uncovered

Critical Analysis  
of Developments in State Aid 2022

## Acknowledgements

A book is always a collective project. The weekly articles and this volume would not have been possible without the support of Lexxion's editorial team. I would like to thank in particular Julia Thiemann and August Andreae.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publisher.

The publisher expressly disclaims all responsibility and liability with regard to the topicality, correctness, completeness or quality of the information provided.

The articles in this book were originally published as weekly posts on Lexxion's State Aid Blog, accessible at: [www.lexxion.eu/en/state-aid-blog](http://www.lexxion.eu/en/state-aid-blog).

ISBN Print: 978-3-86965-397-6

ISBN E-Book: 978-3-86965-398-3

© 2023 Lexxion Publisher, Berlin  
[www.lexxion.eu](http://www.lexxion.eu)

Cover: [tinahoffmann.eu](http://tinahoffmann.eu), Berlin  
Typeset: [info@sb-satz.de](mailto:info@sb-satz.de), Berlin

# Table of Contents

<b>1. Introduction</b> . . . . .	11
<b>2. State Resources</b> . . . . .	15
2.1. State Resources & Security of Energy Supply . . . . .	15
2.2. Funding of Aid with Revenue from Levies Imposed on the Aid Beneficiaries (Milk quality tests) . . . . .	19
2.3. Intra-State Transfers and the Discretion of Public Authorities . . . . .	22
<b>3. Advantage</b> . . . . .	26
3.1. “Substantial” Competitive Effect . . . . .	26
3.2. Compensation and Advantage . . . . .	31
3.3. Compensation for Damage and De Minimis Aid . . . . .	38
3.4. Injection of Capital in a Postal Operator . . . . .	44
3.5. The Date on which State Aid is Deemed to be Granted Is not necessarily the Date on which the Actual Benefit Materialises. . . . .	51
3.6. Market Economy Operator Test: Why Grant a Loan to an Undertaking in Difficulty? . . . . .	55
3.7. The State Behaving Like a Private Land Owner . . . . .	62
3.8. Public Authorities Acting as Private Creditors . . . . .	67
3.9. Advantage in Contracts to Provide Services . . . . .	75
3.10. Private Creditor and the Ability of the Debtor to Repay . . . . .	80
3.11. Advantage from Non-compliance with State Aid Guidelines . . . . .	91
3.12. State Guarantees without State Aid . . . . .	95
3.13. State Guarantees for Undertakings in Difficulty . . . . .	101
<b>4. Selectivity</b> . . . . .	111
4.1. A Non-Selective Financial Tax with a Narrow Scope . . . . .	111
4.2. Territoriality and the Tax Treatment of Intra-group Transactions . . . . .	119

4.3.	Selectivity of Regional Schemes . . . . .	130
4.4.	The “Arm’s Length Principle” and the Taxation of Transactions between Related Companies. . . . .	136
<b>5.</b>	<b>Affectation of Trade</b> . . . . .	145
5.1.	No Effect on Trade . . . . .	145
<b>6.</b>	<b>Article 107(2)(a)</b> . . . . .	150
6.1.	An Innovative Scheme to Support Individual Borrowers . . . . .	150
<b>7.</b>	<b>Article 107(2)(b)</b> . . . . .	159
7.1.	Compensation for Damage from a Natural Disaster . . . . .	159
7.2.	Compensation for Damage from an Exceptional Occurrence. . . . .	164
<b>8.</b>	<b>Article 107(3)(b)</b> . . . . .	176
8.1.	Individual Aid to Counter the Effects of Serious Economic Disturbance . . . . .	176
<b>9.</b>	<b>Environmental and Energy Aid</b> . . . . .	185
9.1.	Public Funding of an Energy Infrastructure Project. . . . .	185
9.2.	Natural Gas Storage . . . . .	190
9.3.	The Link between State Aid and Environmental Provisions of EU Law . . . . .	197
<b>10.</b>	<b>Regional Aid</b> . . . . .	206
10.1.	Duplication of Infrastructure Does not Promote Regional Development . . . . .	206
10.2.	Special Economic Zones . . . . .	211
<b>11.</b>	<b>Research Aid</b> . . . . .	218
11.1.	Economic Activities of a Research Organisation . . . . .	218
11.2.	Research Organisations, their Primary Objectives and their Shareholders. . . . .	231
11.3.	Support for Research & Innovation in the Context of the Temporary Framework . . . . .	239

<b>12. Risk Finance</b> . . . . .	243
12.1. Tax Incentives to Corporate Investors . . . . .	243
<b>13. Undertakings in Difficulty</b> . . . . .	249
13.1. The Concept of “Undertaking in Difficulty” and Evidential Requirements . . . . .	249
<b>14. Rescue Aid</b> . . . . .	257
14.1. The Rights of Competitors of Rescued Undertakings . . . . .	257
14.2. The Difficulty of Separating the various Causes of Financial Difficulties. . . . .	265
<b>15. Article 106(2)</b> . . . . .	272
15.1. Altmark Compliant Measure . . . . .	272
15.2. A Rare Commission Decision on SGEI Interpreting Decision 2012/21 . . . . .	280
15.3. Compensation for the Net Cost of Public Service Obligations. . . . .	287
15.4. What Costs Must be Included in Compensation for Public Service Obligations? . . . . .	299
<b>16. Article 93.</b> . . . . .	308
16.1. State Aid for External Transport Costs . . . . .	308
16.2. Compliance with Public Service Obligations Does Not Necessarily Entitle the Providers of Public Services to Compensation . . . . .	314
<b>17. State Aid Procedures</b> . . . . .	321
17.1. The Commission Need not Always Open the Formal Investigation Procedure before Correcting a Faulty Decision. . .	321
17.2. The Standard of Proof in State Aid Complaints and the “Informational Disadvantage” of Complainants . . . . .	324
17.3. Legal Standing of Competitors . . . . .	329
17.4. The Consequences of not Knowing when State Aid is State Aid . . . . .	334
17.5. State Aid and Anti-Competitive Practices . . . . .	339

<b>18. Recovery of Incompatible State Aid</b> . . . . .	344
18.1. Consequences of Failure to Recover Incompatible Aid . . . . .	344
18.2. Member States Must Recover of their Own Initiative Illegally Granted Aid. . . . .	348
18.3. Recovery of Incompatible Aid and the Application of General Provisions for the Avoidance of Double Taxation . . .	351
18.4. Temporary Crisis Framework . . . . .	359